

where each one matters to whoever hold it, including the teacher. The vision of the educational process as one in which the search for meaning in life is encouraged and modelled by both teachers and curriculum is a pleasant one. Educators would do well to take Plunkett seriously.

Barbara Wyman
University of Calgary

Silver, H. & Brennan, J. (1988). *A liberal vocationalism*. New York: Methuen, 277 pp., \$22.00 (softcover).

Apparently the Duke of Edinburgh once stated that "If it's easy to start an argument about transport, it is just as easy to start a riot about education and training." Going beyond this provocative quotation, Harold Silver and John Brennan attempt to stop the riot by stimulating a discussion. A debate between relative differences in education and training should challenge the values of educators as they plan for entry into the 21st century. It is indicative of the problem, however, that the topic remains a fringe discussion in most curricula. The worth of this monograph, which examines and calls for a review of basic assumptions, might be of most significance if the "hybrid phrase" (p. 233) of the title attracts thinkers positioned on either side of the issue.

The book, based upon research sponsored by the Council for National Academic Awards, London, is divided into three parts. Section 1 is an excellent summary of the stigma and dichotomies that have evolved out of polarized arguments that split theory and practice, knowing and doing, reflective thought and skilled action. The authors also place the context of their research within the realities of the late 20th century by recognizing that public demands for accountability and relevance are likely to shape public policy for the indefinite future. Canadian educators, wishing to understand how their educational system evolved, will find the historical analysis of how schisms between education and training were created in England and Scotland a useful framework for consideration. Some reflection about educational roots would place in context the existent distinctiveness of the Canadian educational systems.

Section 1 is worth a read just to review the quality of the arguments; included are references to John Stuart Mill, Cardinal John Henry Newman, C.P. Snow, Lord Eric Ashby, the Duke of Edinburgh, A.N. Whitehead, John Dewey, and Martin Trow — all illustrious articulators of the classical academic tradition. While there is not unanimity of opinion, phrases such as "intellectual vision," "special illumination," "contribute(s) both to his own happiness and his social usefulness" and "creators of knowledge" are characteristic descriptors of the value of higher education (pp. 4, 9, 15, 36).

Section 2, a reporting of the results of the research, is a summary of voices that are less well-known and of experiences that have not been previously analyzed. This section comprises the major portion of the book and reports the results of research that examines the concept of vocationalism through the "eyes" of the course designers and instructors (p. 234). These are the directors and principals, the teachers and curriculum consultants of higher educational institutions in Britain who prepare students to become engineers, businessmen and women, and developers of the "built environment" (architects, land and estate management, and planners). Institutional prospectuses and course aims and objectives were reviewed with the purpose of understanding the implications of what is normally thought to be an undergraduate vocational education. The universal rejection of the term *vocational* by these educational leaders and their use of phrases such as a "balanced curriculum," "new horizons in terms of thought and learning," "the whole person," and "people operating with a community" (pp. 122, 162, 180) suggests that maintaining a debate between concepts of "education" and "training" would continue to litter the "historical wasteland of vocabularies" (p. 30). It might also perpetuate a debate that rests more upon British 19th century concepts of "gentlemanliness, leisure, and privilege" reserved for a country's "social elite" (p. 26) than upon the development of a 21st century North American, especially a Canadian, intellectual elite.

As the authors conclude in section 3, a serious analysis of "vocationalism" must examine relationships between "abstract values" and the impact of political, economic, and labor market realities. Their methodology includes the people and the courses responsible for developing a new elite — those who will lead society in resolving technological, postindustrial business, and environmental issues. These will be the emergent and critically important problems during the next century. Unfortunately, the research methodology did not include the students themselves and, as all educators know, educator intentions and curriculum aims and objectives are often not what is actually learned in the classroom.

In Canada, the student population of colleges and universities (and also those of secondary schools) is changing rapidly because of the increasing numbers of reentry students, some of whom have considerable work experience. In addition, increasing numbers of students who have recently completed a technical institute or college diploma are enrolling in university degree programs: A reverse trend is also identifiable: increasing numbers of university graduates are entering technical institutes and colleges to earn a diploma in a specific field. Therefore, in the hybrid maze that is Canadian education, transferability can be more of an issue than vocationalism. For example, while British Columbia and Alberta have community colleges somewhat linked to university systems by systemic acknowledgements of earned credits (although not universal

acceptance), Ontario has separate streams for technical and university students. Consequently, students must argue for a review of individual courses — a cumbersome procedure that is being re-evaluated. At a conceptual level, Canadian educators are more influenced by Donald Schön's "reflective practice" than the Europeans are. What appears to be developing in North America is an application of the UNESCO concept of lifelong learning. That is, more and more people are combining school and work in variations of full and part-time schedules throughout their adult lives. Since the 1980s, the range extends from 14-year-old youth to senior citizens. Implications of this demographic change in student profiles have not fully been understood by either those responsible for "curriculum maps" or by the policy makers who delegate funds.

Although the Canadian situation is not reviewed, this book contains a bonus for those who are interested in comparative education. There is a good description of how polytechnics, colleges, and institutes have emerged during the 20th century and how well they understand their public sector "mission" (p. 6). Comparisons among British, Scottish, American, Polish, French, and German mandates for this level of postsecondary education reveal important cultural distinctions. Most noticeable is that the British schools of engineering have less status than similar American schools while the British schools of business administration are more comparable with those of West Germany than they are with French or the American schools. It would be interesting to have the study replicated in Canada.

A matrix that compares courses and entry to employment situations will also be of interest to those who analyze national planning schemes which attempt to match graduates and employment. The examination of course descriptions and their relationship to training models is an interesting method of analyzing what has been a very difficult relationship to establish: the link between education and employment. The eight types range from Type A, "sole regulation and completed training of which medicine is an example" (p. 41), to Type H, "open market and nonrelevant education of which the humanities and social sciences are examples" (p. 50). Education as a career is considered to be comparable to engineering (Type B) in that it represents a preparation for employment but is not a "license to practice." In Canada, the increasing drive to professionalize teacher training may be a reflection of the changing labor market and public pressure as much as a desire to upgrade internal standards. With regard to student destinations, the 1984 and 1986 Secretary of State National Surveys of postsecondary graduates seem to confirm that the match between graduates of professional schools and the marketing of their education is closest, while fine arts graduates and humanities graduates have more difficulty in finding employment directly related to their educational qualifications. While the dynamics of marketplace supply and demand affect careers during the short term, two years after graduation a university education does provide access to

more stable, interesting employment, although the economic return on educational investment is generally less than it was during the 1960s.

Finally, the identification of six characteristics that were common features in all of the institutions, regardless of specific curriculum, has relevance to Canadian readers because they are undoubtedly a component of Canadian higher education. These characteristics include: growth of interdisciplinary curricula, curricula that is socially relevant, an emphasis upon breadth of courses and of outcomes, a concern with long-term employment needs, a desire to produce graduates who are critical thinkers, and an openness to new partnerships with business and industry.

In summary, *A Liberal Vocationalism* makes three important points, beyond that of the "yes but" statements of educators who teach vocationally-oriented students (p. 245). First, educators, regardless of their professional orientations, should explore their values within the contexts of changed social realities. They must place "educational traditions and ambiguities under sustained scrutiny" (p. 252). Second, policy must reflect not the "zigzags of national planning," but "relationships between curricula and institutional identities" and current social and cultural contexts (p. 251). Third, research must be conducted at all levels of education to assess the standards, purposes, and consequences of educating students. If this book stimulates an interest in evaluating the missions, aims, objectives, or accreditations of the educational systems, it will have accomplished both the liberal and the vocational objectives of the researchers.

E. Lisbeth Donaldson
University of Calgary

Roth, J. (1990). *The disturbed subject: Epistemological and ethical implications of reactivity in videotape research*. (American University Studies, Series VIII, Psychology, Vol. 20). New York: Peter Lang, 134 pp., \$30.50 (hardcover).

In the past few decades, there have been a number of significant concerns and developments that have negated the attention of those who study the behavior of human subjects in field settings. One was the issue of reactivity and generating methods that would eliminate or reduce its impact. A second matter was the ethics of their activities and methods. A third development was the adoption of the audio-visual media as a method of data collection and analysis and for the reporting of research results.