

The daunting task of translation was performed with commendable efficiency by Martin G. Haindorff. It nonetheless remains an obvious translation with the style heavy and the terminology intrusive in passages. But that is to judge the translation by the very high standards that Haindorff sets for himself in an introductory note.

*Adult Education in the Federal Republic of Germany* is published in the series of Monographs on Comparative and Area Studies in Adult Education edited by Jindra Kulich. All involved are to be congratulated on their initiative in bringing the work of adult educators in other languages to English-speaking colleagues who, judging by this publication, are clear beneficiaries.

Denis O'Sullivan  
University College  
Cork, Ireland

Kach, N. & Mazurek, K. (Eds.). (1992). *Exploring our educational past*. Calgary: Detselig Enterprises, 213 pp., \$18.95 (softcover).

This collection of essays represents a tribute to the 25th anniversary of the Department of Educational Foundations and to the 50th anniversary of the Faculty of Education at the University of Alberta. The authors included here were all associated with the Department at one time, and their work illustrates the scope and diversity of scholarship developed there. Consequently, this collection does not provide an overview or a sustained analysis of education in Alberta; the 10 essays illustrate the interests and interpretations of various historians.

The editors provide a historiographical context for these essays in their introduction, "Is There a History of Education in Alberta?" Kach and Mazurek account for the lack of a single, definitive history of education by reviewing the interpretations which have dominated the writing of educational history. They maintain that current scholarship is characterized by its diversity. Still, they identify four principles illustrated by the essays and thereby bring some unity to this collection: All the authors accept that educational history is essentially social history. According to the definitions provided by Kach and Mazurek, all the authors in the collection are "moderate revisionists"; while they are interested in the dialectic power of relations, they emphasize the response of the minority group or community; and, above all, these scholars analyze issues which help us make sense of contemporary educational conflicts.

Accordingly, the first section of the book consists of four essays which examine issues of religion, culture, and language in education. In "Hostility Unmasked: Catholic Schooling in Territorial Alberta," Robert Carney examines the major events in the evolution of Catholic education in Alberta. He emphasizes the influence of the church hierarchy in creating a unique school system, suitable to the frontier society of territorial Alberta. While Carney essentially traces the response of one institution to another, he describes the roots of a school structure still evident in the Catholic school system, and clarifies its ongoing search for recognition as an important partner in public education.

In "Brokers of Cultural Change: British Wesleyan Missionaries in Rupert's Land, 1840-1854," Michael Owen offers a balanced account of the impact of the missionaries on native communities. He argues that the missionaries' efforts to convert native peoples to Christianity included an introduction to other elements of European civilization. Though the reaction of the native community remains difficult to assess, Owen challenges the view that missionaries imposed their culture on the native community: "The brief tenure of the Wesleyan missionaries can be viewed as a period of adaptation. The Wesleyans, despite their agenda for change, did accommodate themselves to the needs of their Native adherents" (p. 51). Brian Titley provides a more sinister view of the efforts of churches

and the state to assimilate Native people in "Red Deer Industrial School: A Case Study in the History of Native Education." He clearly accepts the view that schools were an agent of social control intended to suppress native aspirations. Titley reviews the litany of problems at the Red Deer school: brutal discipline, incompetent teachers, disease, rowdy and abusive behavior on the part of students, poor sanitary conditions, and financial difficulties. True to the ethnographic methodology of the volume, Titley stresses the active hostility of the Native community toward the industrial school; parents refused to send their children to the school and he concludes that this was largely responsible for its closure. His analysis would be more convincing if he had consulted church, as well as government, archives. Titley fails to consider adequately the sentiments and sincere intentions of some of the Red Deer school administrators. In "The Schools and French- and Ukrainian-Language Claims in Alberta to 1918," Manoly Lupul examines the development of French-language legislation and traces the impact of an emerging Ukrainian national consciousness on education in Alberta. His description of the conflict over Ukrainian-language teaching is a good illustration of the cultural dynamics involved in educational issues.

The second section of the book contains three essays in which the authors discuss access to and equality in education. Rebecca Coulter's essay, "Learning a Living: Some Aspects of Education and Employment for Alberta Youth, 1920-1950," challenges the view that, by the 1920s, Canada's young people were enjoying a lengthy and relatively protected adolescence. She demonstrates the impact of class, race, and gender on issues of employment, and offers a comprehensive analysis of the records of the Canadian Youth Commission of the 1940s and of the Dominion-Provincial Youth Training Program in Alberta in the late 1930s.

Nancy Sheehan, in "Women and Education in Alberta: The Rhetoric and the Reality," argues that between 1905 and 1950 there was a rhetoric of equality in education for women but the reality was far different. Female students and teachers were subject to condescending attitudes and systematic discrimination which stifled their ambitions and denied them opportunities. By reviewing areas of gender inequity in education, Sheehan

demonstrates the need for more insight into the reaction of women that we need more information about the lives of female students and a greater appreciation of the enormous impact of female teachers on generations of students. Unfortunately, Sheehan limits her discussion of the women's response to systematic discrimination to a review of the educational efforts of women's organizations like the WCTU, IODE, and Women's Institutes. She argues that their strategy of "separation" ultimately failed to challenge the structural inequalities in Alberta education.

Roy Wilson examines the rural school problem in Alberta between 1890 and 1930 in "Rural Equality." He argues that parents and educators in rural communities disagreed on the nature of schooling in the face of urbanization and industrialization: Should children receive an education appropriate for a rural lifestyle, or should they be prepared to become part of an urban workforce? In essence, Wilson explains and illustrates both sides of this debate, but insists that a consensus regarding the purpose of rural schooling never emerged. He argues that while administrative restructuring and centralization solved many of the financial problems of rural school boards, they marked the end of the school as the focus of rural community activity. His sense of loss is amplified by a dramatic use of language: "Destiny took them to the countryside where, living in crude shelters, they struggled to eke sustenance from the land" (p. 135). However his argument that a valuable element of rural schooling was lost in restructuring is undermined by his comprehensive and convincing demonstration of the failures of rural teachers and administrators.

In the final section of the book the authors examine the controversy surrounding progressive education in Alberta. In "The Emergence of Progressive Education in Alberta," Nick Kach summarizes educational developments in Alberta until 1935, when the first experiments with progressive education were introduced. His summary of legislative and policy changes in education before 1935 repeats much of the information found in earlier essays in the collection. He offers a comprehensive summary of the philosophy and principles of progressive education as defined in books by its leading proponents and in curriculum documents. Kach, however, leaves several questions unanswered. He concludes that

"no educational movement had ever been so enthusiastically supported or so scornfully denounced" (p. 172), but offers little evidence that these educational reforms were in fact supported by anyone other than the Department of Education. He also fails to address the extent to which these policies were implemented in Alberta classrooms.

The rhetoric surrounding the denunciation of progressive education is analyzed by Campbell Ross in "The Neatby Debate in Alberta: Clue to a National Dialectic." He places the history of education within the realm of Canadian intellectual history which he defines — in Hegelian terms — as the study of the clash of ideas. In this sense the debate generated by Hilda Neatby's *So Little for the Mind* offers a valuable insight into the intellectual milieu of the 1950s. Ross argues that Hilda Neatby and University of Alberta Professor W.G. Hardy represented the challenge of traditional scholars to progressive educators and "experts" who had undermined their understanding of the ends of education and excluded them from educational reform. He insists that they typify the tradition of philosophic idealism defined by historian Brian McKillop. He argues the current clashes regarding educational policy represent the continuing "dialectic between a progressive and conservative political cosmology" (p. 187). In this sense, Ross offers a valuable reminder to other scholars of educational history that schooling is not simply the exercise of power and social control; an examination of what is actually taught in schools offers important insights into the intellectual priorities of societies.

Nick Kach and Kas Mazurek examine the government's response to criticisms of progressive education in the final article, "The Cameron Commission and the Social Context of Educational Reform." They begin by reviewing criticisms of progressive education, including Neatby's and Hardy's arguments which are more fully examined in Ross's article. They define the mandate of the Commission but fail to give an indication of who submitted briefs for consideration. A lengthier analysis of the participants in the Commission would have been valuable in assessing the methodology of the Commission. Finally, the authors review the recommendations made by the Commission and list the action taken on each recommendation by the Department of Education, the Alberta Teachers' Association, the

Alberta School Trustees' Association, and the Alberta Federation of Home and School Associations. There is little analysis of or explanation for the reactions of these groups. Their assertion that it is difficult to empirically assess the impact of the Commission should not have discouraged them from coming to some conclusion about the nature of the debate and the process of educational reform as exemplified by the Cameron Commission. Like the other authors included in the volume, Kach and Mazurek make a valiant effort to define the human response to power structures like educational institutions, but they also demonstrate the difficulty of the task.

In their introduction, Kach and Mazurek describe the historians included in this collection as revisionists: They seek to illustrate the importance of issues of power and inequality in education. The essays are characterized as exercises in "ethnographic" history (p. 6): While they demonstrate the importance of social control as an educational objective, they also attempt to trace the response of individuals or minority communities to the demands of conformity imposed by the school system. But in the sense that these historians deal with questions of social control and depend almost exclusively on government sources, they perpetuate the problem the editors attribute to an earlier phase of educational historiography: They "ignore what actually happened and happens in classrooms" (p. 6).

However, this collection amply illustrates the diversity of interests represented by educational historians affiliated with the University of Alberta. The essays demonstrate the influence of women's, ethnic, and social historians on educational historiography. As a result, we have a much broader understanding of educational developments. In this sense, students of the history of education in Alberta will be well served by this collection.

Amy von Heyking  
Calgary