

guide for visitors to Bathurst Inlet Lodge, where the author has spent many summers.

This book does indeed fill the gap and provides a useful reference for those visiting and residing in the North. It deals with only the most common species that one might encounter on a sojourn across the tundra. The book is not confined to vascular plants, as a few of the more showy lichens (*Xanthoria elegans*, *Thamnolia subuliformis*, etc.) are highlighted. Visitors interested in lichens are referred to other sources. Curiously, mosses are not mentioned in the book, although they are an important part of the arctic ecosystem and may provide spectacular shows in some areas.

The author has attempted to provide a book that is midway between a picture book and technical flora. Species accounts are arranged, for the most part, in systematic order, although some families are lumped together in strange groupings. For example, grasses, sedges, lilies, orchids and mare's tail are in one grouping, and a grouping entitled "Miscellaneous" contains everything from Primrose family (Primulaceae) through Leadwort family (Plumbaginaceae). Large families (e.g., Compositae) are given their own grouping. While many readers familiar with plant families will attempt to locate a species according to systematic order, they may be confused by the lumping of mare's tail in with the grasses, sedges, lilies and orchids and with the Miscellaneous category. However, an index is provided that should alleviate the confusion. Keys based on flower shape and colour are provided for those not familiar with the plant families. The keys are simple, free of technical jargon and easy to use. Keys are also provided for plants with berries or fruits and trees or shrubs over 30 cm tall. Many plants can be keyed using flower or fruit or, if a tree or shrub, by leaf characteristics.

The species accounts make for interesting reading. Common names, in English and where available in Inuinaktun, and scientific names are provided for each species. The taxonomy follows that of Porsild and Cody (1980) and the author refers the reader to that reference for additional information. The nomenclature of some species has changed since 1980, but by keeping the names provided in Porsild and Cody the author has attempted to alleviate confusion that can be discouraging to someone not familiar with the latest nomenclatural changes. Distinguishing features of the species are presented, as are characteristics that separate it from other similar but less common species. Technical terms are avoided where possible, but an illustrated glossary is provided for any terms that may be unfamiliar to the reader. The reader is referred to Porsild and Cody for some difficult groups (e.g., mustards, grasses, sedges). However, the reader is not warned of one of the most perplexing groups, *Draba*, and only one species, *Draba glabella*, is dealt with in the text. The habitat of the species is described and some information on the range is given. Tidbits of information, such as literal translation of the Latin name, origin of the common name, value of the plant to indigenous peoples, use by fauna and species biology, are often included. In addition, the paraphrased text has been translated into Inuinaktun and thus the book will be of value to residents of the central Arctic who cannot read English. The author is apologetic because syllabics are not provided for the translation due to problems with funding and lack of knowledge. Each species is illustrated with colour photographs. The photos are of good quality and when used together with the text, the reader should be able to identify the plant under examination.

There is also a section on botanizing in various arctic communities (Holman, Coppermine, Bathurst Inlet, Bay Chimo, Cambridge Bay, Gjoa Haven, Spence Bay and Pelly Bay). These accounts include information on the history of the community and key habitats and plants and where to find them. It is refreshing to see that the author has also dealt with the issues of collection of species that appear to be rare and with transplantation.

There are very few factual errors in the text. The most obvious is that Least willow (*Salix herbacea*) is not the most northern willow and in Canada does not grow north of 80°. However, Arctic willow (*Salix arctica*) takes this honour and is common throughout the Arctic. It is not mentioned in the text.

I would recommend this book for anyone interested in plants who is working or living in the North. While it is intended for the lay person, professional and amateur botanists will find it of value for the tidbits of information provided in the text and the good photographs. The author has done a good job of meeting her objective in providing an illustrated field guide for the plants of the "Barrenlands."

REFERENCE

- PORSILD, A.E., and CODY, W.J. 1980. Vascular plants of continental Northwest Territories, Canada. Ottawa: National Museum of Natural Sciences, National Museums of Canada. viii + 667 p.

Joyce Gould
Alberta Forestry, Lands and Wildlife
4th Floor, Petroleum Plaza, South Tower
9915 - 108 Street
Edmonton, Alberta, Canada
T5K 2C9

- UNRAVELLING THE FRANKLIN MYSTERY: INUIT TESTIMONY. By DAVID C. WOODMAN. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1991. 390 p., maps, illus., appendices. Hardbound. Cdn\$29.95.

Our ways of thinking about history, literature, and anthropology have changed dramatically in recent years, and David C. Woodman's *Unravelling the Franklin Mystery: Inuit Testimony* is one of the many new fruits borne of this shift in thinking. In essence, Woodman looks once more at the historical events surrounding the disappearance of John Franklin's 1845 expedition, but instead of relying on the authority of white civilization's record keeping, Woodman rereads the native accounts and stories that tell of Inuit experiences with survivors of the *Erebus* and *Terror*. The word "rereads" is important here, for the tales, collected by such men as Hall, Schwatka, and Rae and recorded in their journals, had been "read" many times before. And in those previous readings, any contradictions between Inuit and white reports were clarified at the expense of Inuit testimony. Native accounts of what they had seen in their own country were deemed faulty, the product of exaggeration or fear or ignorance, and the European words inscribed in official documents or messages buried in cairns were considered impeccable expressions of Truth.

For example, because Fitzjames reported that the men deserted the ships on 22 April 1848, common sense would clearly reject as erroneous a native report that an Inuk had visited Franklin's ships in 1849. And reject such confused nonsense is precisely what the received interpretation has done. Woodman, however, recognizes the deception inherent in that universalizing source of knowledge we call "common sense." It is not at all universal, but is a deceptive trap unconsciously laid by a persuasive and dominating culture; it is "sensible" only to a like-minded segment of the world's population who hold "common" values. Such ethnocentric thinking is precisely what Woodman tries to identify in the traditional European explanations of what happened to the crews of the *Erebus* and *Terror*. In place of such skewed interpretations, Woodman suggests alternative readings that attempt to accommodate both European and Inuit accounts.

He pursues the "sense" of Inuit accounts from a number of paths. Perhaps the most significant realization arising out of his quest is that, while the Inuit were "exceedingly reliable witnesses" (p. 321), it is extremely difficult to determine which event they were witnessing. Thus, many of the apparent Inuit contradictions to documented Admiralty evidence stem from white confusion about which British officer was visited or aided, or which "Shartoo" ("the flat one"; p. 285) or "Omanek" ("the heart-shaped place"; p. 61) was in the teller's mind when he spoke of a geographical feature. The error was not one of Inuit veracity, but of ambiguities misinterpreted by Hall and Schwatka and other early collectors and interpreters of these tales.

That Woodman's source of Inuit oral legends is the written records of whites is not only ironic, it is the origin of the confusion. Woodman

argues that, in initially listening to Inuit stories and recording those considered relevant, these white searchers were guilty — through selection, arrangement, and contextualization — of unconsciously manipulating what they heard. Such “editing” did not arise from any intention to deceive, but from the inevitable confusion present when one culture is asked to perceive experience through the eyes of another. The problem has since been immensely compounded by readings that too easily dismiss troublesome Inuit reports.

The book is clearly organized, Woodman using the metaphor of a court of inquiry to present his evidence. Perhaps more accurately, Woodman presents his interpretation of the evidence, for there is no new evidence in this book, only a rethinking of what has been available for many years. He begins with a brief introduction to Franklin's expedition and his disappearance. The first chapter then addresses pre-1845 contacts between Inuit and whites among the arctic islands. An important chapter, it sets the stage for the possibility of significant relations between Franklin and the Inuit. The next chapter surveys the numerous white expeditions that attempted to determine Franklin's fate — Rae, Anderson and Stewart, McClintock, Hall, and Schwatka. A third chapter builds a case for the general reliability of Inuit reports, including a weak section on Inuit folklore, and some excellent pages on European assessments of Inuit stories. From this point forward, nearly 300 pages, Woodman turns his attention to an extremely detailed reading of the numerous Inuit legends relating to the Franklin expedition. The book draws no firm conclusions about the fate of the crews of Franklin's ships, but it certainly casts doubt on a number of traditional interpretations, particularly concerning the movement towards Starvation Cove.

It would be impossible to review Woodman's book without mentioning Owen Beattie's efforts over the past decade to determine the fate of the lost expedition. Woodman himself feels compelled to include an appendix on lead poisoning. What seems of special relevance to my reading of *Unravelling the Franklin Mystery* is that Beattie and Woodman, working nearly 150 years after the Franklin disaster, use contrasting methods in an attempt to solve the same riddle. Beattie employed the highly technical tools of forensic anthropology and medicine to acquire new data. Woodman, antithetically, reassesses old stories and legends gathered over a century ago from a nomadic hunting society. While neither Beattie nor Woodman ultimately produces concrete answers, it is promising that understanding might also be gained by looking outside the narrow ethnocentric limits of European thinking and technological virtuosity.

Richard C. Davis
Department of English
The University of Calgary
2500 University Drive N.W.
Calgary, Alberta, Canada
T2N 1N4

THE TLINGIT INDIANS. By GEORGE THORNTON EMMONS. Edited with additions by FREDERICA DE LAGUNA and with a biography by JEAN LOW. Anthropological Papers of the American Museum of Natural History, Number 70. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1992. 530 p., 65 drawings, 127 b&w photos, maps, tables, notes, bib., index. Hardbound. US\$60.00.

George Thornton Emmons served as a lieutenant in the U.S. Navy in southeastern Alaska during the 1880s and 1890s. After retiring from the service in 1899, he returned to Alaska many times, principally to collect Native artifacts for various museums. Over the years, Emmons published many articles and reports regarding Tlingit arts, crafts, technology, social life and history.

In 1900 he began work on what he hoped would be a definitive ethnography of the Tlingit. In addition to his own field research, he searched other ethnographies and monographs for material to supplement his own observations and interviews. He continued to rewrite and edit his manuscripts, but the book was still not finished when he died in 1945.

After his death, Frederica de Laguna, a leading authority on Tlingit studies, began to reorganize and supplement Emmons's various drafts and manuscripts. She continued to edit and revise *The Tlingit Indians* for the next thirty years. As a result, what we have today is not only the original work of Emmons, but extensive additions and annotations by Dr. de Laguna. Dr. Jeff Leer, a linguist specializing in the Tlingit language, transcribed the Tlingit terms into linguistic notation and provided additional information regarding many of the terms and concepts.

Following the excellent biography of Emmons, there are 17 chapters, each analyzing and comparing various facets of Tlingit life and culture. De Laguna oftentimes reorganized Emmons's material to integrate it in a more orderly manner. In addition to Emmons's original sketches and photographs, the editor added many other photographs and illustrations from a variety of sources. Emmons's contribution is particularly strong in the area of technology, arts, foods and daily life. De Laguna's strength is in her presentation of the social organization, values and history of the Tlingit. Leer, of course, has developed a keen understanding of the language. The end result, then, is a comprehensive description of the Tlingit, with hundreds of historic photographs and illustrations.

Readers may find the book a little overwhelming at first. For those not familiar with linguistic notation, there is a key to pronunciation on page xiv. I found it useful to photocopy this page and have it available for help in pronouncing the many Tlingit terms in the text. A few readers may find that the type in the annotations and additions is relatively small, but considering the voluminous information, the small type was probably necessary to keep the book to a manageable size. A third problem may arise with the references to the many Tlingit clans. On page 436 there are two lists of Tlingit clans. The first list is by Emmons, with his own style of transcription, and the second list has the same names in linguistic notation. Since Emmons records 34 Raven clans and 32 Wolf or Eagle clans, it would have been cumbersome to write out the lengthy clan names every time they were mentioned. As a result, de Laguna chose to number the clans and then refers to them by number, such as Raven 24 or Wolf 17. Readers may also want to photocopy the clan list on page 436 and keep that list handy for clan identification.

In the back of the book are 37 tables and charts listing such things as house names, products, population, foods, medicines and calendars. This information is extremely useful for analysis and comparison.

Because Emmons was mistaken about or not aware of some aspects of Tlingit life, de Laguna has added her comments and additions to correct these shortcomings and provide more recent and accurate information. The monograph is thoroughly documented with an 11-page bibliography. There is also an extensive index.

The book itself is technically superb. The text, photographs and illustrations are all very clear. The maps inside the front and back covers enable the reader to locate the various subdivisions of the Tlingit, the neighboring Eskimos of Prince William Sound and Northwest Coast tribes to the south.

The Tlingit Indians, in my estimation, is one of the best studies of the Tlingit, and perhaps of any North American Native group. It ranks right up there with de Laguna's monumental, three-volume ethnography of the Tlingit of Yakutat, *Under Mount Saint Elias*. It is so extensive and well documented that it will no doubt stand as one of the major references on the Tlingit for many years to come. Laypersons will find it informative, but maybe a little too detailed, unless they are particularly interested in the Tlingit. But for students of anthropology, those interested in the Northwest Coast and American Indian researchers, it is a major contribution to the literature. I have asked some well-educated Tlingit what they thought of the book. Those who had read it said that they were impressed not only with the detailed information and its accuracy, but the respectful way in which Emmons and de Laguna treat them and their culture.

Although \$60 may seem somewhat expensive, *The Tlingit Indians* is well worth the price. Libraries, anthropology departments and individuals will realize that the book is a good investment not only for information on the Tlingit, but for analysis and comparison of Northwest Coast technology, social organization and history.