Book Review

Cultures, Communities, and Conflict: Histories of Canadian Universities and War

Paul Stortz and E. Lisa Panayotidis, editors
Toronto, Ontario: University of Toronto Press, 2012

Reviewed by: Anastasia Kulpa
University of Alberta

In *Cultures, Communities, and Conflict: Histories of Canadian Universities and War*, Stortz and Panayotidis edit 11 chapters, which explore shifts in Canadian university education in response to war. These chapters explore the relationship between higher education in Canada and war, looking at similarities and differences between student and faculty experiences across various institutions and variations based on different conflicts. Six chapters focus primarily on World War I, two chapters focus on World War II, and the remaining three chapters respectively address academic freedom in war time, compare the Canadian and British university systems during the two world wars, and discuss the effect of the Vietnam War on university education. Five chapters are firmly anchored in discussion of particular campuses during particular wars, while the remaining six chapters explore themes, such as women’s participation in higher education, shifts in scientific research and academic freedom, and the development of military technology on multiple campuses throughout multiple wars. Four chapters specifically examine the experience of university students during wartime, five chapters are primarily interested in the experiences and concerns of faculty, and two chapters examine themes that are relevant to both student and faculty, such as the notion of generation and definitions of and responses to imperialism. Overarching themes of this edition include varying responses to and effects of war based on different positions within the university and society more broadly.

Each chapter advances a different argument about the nature of relationships between Canadian universities and the experience of war. Moody’s investigation of Acadia University in Wolfville, Nova Scotia, at the onset of World War I reveals an institution dedicated to evangelism and committed to social change. This environment prompted both staff and students to be more critical of British actions during the war and to be more concerned with progressive social change in the postwar period. Kulberg argues that the goal of developing forestry into a profession driven by ideals of service to the public resulted in higher than usual enlistments from the University of Toronto’s Faculty of Forestry and caused tensions surrounding how to address returning veterans with less than stellar academic records. Quiney contends that over the course of World War I, female undergraduates who were unwilling to do the kind of patriotic service their mothers had done reinvented Red Cross service work. Similarly, over the same period, Quiney claims that faculty became less supportive of appeals to involve students in extended work with the Red Cross, concerned it would interfere with women’s academic studies. Pitsula explores tensions at the University of Saskatchewan in Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, during
World War I between Christian and atheistic conceptions of justifiable war, through the lens of competing images of masculinity. Burke argues that rather than representing a change of direction, World War I merely accelerated changes already underway in women’s education.

Several chapters also discuss the effect of war on academic work. In the same vein as Burke, Hull asserts that World War I accelerated prewar patterns in universities’ movement toward a more research-intensive function. Avery suggests that World War II, by contrast, resulted in important changes to research funding at the university level rather than simply accelerating existing patterns. Horn suggests that wars only challenge academic freedom when they become sacred causes, and offers examples of tensions surrounding the expression of unorthodox opinions by faculty members during World War I and II in relation to government and donor funding decisions. Stortz argues that responses to hiring refugee professors at the University of Toronto during World War II were influenced both by anti-Semitism and a desire to protect the advancement of Canadian scholars. Drawing on examples from Canada and the United Kingdom, Axelrod and Levi argue that, on the whole, universities changed less as a result of World War II than they did during World War I because universities and governments were more aware of both the challenges faced by universities during wartime and the possible contributions universities could make to the war effort. In the final chapter of this edition, Gidney uses the example of teach-ins at the University of Toronto during the Vietnam War to claim, that the idea of wars shaping generations into distinct entities is inadequate, since responses to war provide examples of both intergenerational cooperation and conflict.

These diverse approaches are a strength of this edition. Each chapter is firmly anchored in a particular context, institutional or temporal, and each contributor recognises this particular context. In Moody’s chapter, for example, the effects of these contexts are demonstrated through in-depth discussions of the history of particular campuses and individuals preceding a particular occurrence or response. In Horn’s chapter, awareness of context is evident through frequent and extensive use of quotations from correspondence, newspaper editorials, and minutes of university meetings. In their respective chapters, Quiney and Pitsula discuss rhetorical attempts by individuals and organisations to shape particular actions as appropriate during war. By including these chapters, Stortz and Panayotidis shape an edited volume that explores multiple possible effects of war on the university and detail a variety of responses in Canadian higher education to the First and Second World Wars.

The theme of varied experiences based on position within the university and society is most apparent in relation to gender and the differences between the experiences of faculty and students. Quiney and Burke focus on the experience of female students in the First World War as distinct from their male peers and Pitsula develops arguments about the construction of wartime masculinity. There is also some discussion of ideals of masculinity and femininity in Axelrod and Levi’s chapter. Throughout this edition, there are also discussions of the specificity of student and faculty experiences, notably through chapters that focus on student or faculty experiences. There are also some places where contributors, notably Stortz and Horn, begin to differentiate the experiences of graduate and undergraduate students, although this theme is not explicitly addressed.

Despite these strengths, this edition seems to lack a certain awareness of its own limitations. No edited volume should be expected to cover Canadian universities and war in its entirety, however, editors should recognise the limits of such a subject. Several contributors (in the concluding paragraphs of their respective chapters) address the question of more recent conflicts in Afghanistan, Iraq, and Kosovo, but there are no chapters that discuss these
particular wars in more depth. Although the Cold War lasted for decades with profound effects on Canada, there are no discussions of the effects of this conflict on Canadian universities. Also missing are discussions of peacekeeping missions and the War on Terror. Without these topics, it can be difficult for readers to begin to piece together which aspects of a particular conflict are likely to affect universities in given ways.

There are a cluster of discussions about student and faculty experiences around particular conflicts. Although there are a numbers of chapters that discuss faculty and student experiences, these subjects are primarily clustered in relation to a particular conflict. Discussions of the student experience are predominantly related to the First World War, in Burke, Kuhlberg, Pitsula, and Quiney, and faculty concerns, primarily about research and academic freedom, are mostly related to the Second World War, as discussed in Avery’s and Stortz’s chapters. There are some exceptions to this pattern, for example Hull’s essay, but there are still no focused explorations of the student experience in the Second World War. Furthermore, effects of war on the experiences of faculty are somewhat narrowly conceived as acting primarily through research. Although some authors in the volume have identified the value of considering effects of war on faculty teaching and service, the volume lacks meaningful discussions of these subjects.

Although there is interesting discussion of the effect of gender on the experiences of war in essays by Burke, Pitsula, and Quiney, consideration of other major social statuses are neglected. There are brief mentions of distinctions between privately funded and publically funded universities in Horn’s chapter on academic freedom, and Axelrod and Levi mention the question of class in passing in discussing postwar changes to Britain’s university system. However, the effect of class on the experiences of war on institutions, students, and faculty is not developed. Likewise, aside from brief mention of anti-Semitism as a possible cause for difficulties settling refugee professors in Stortz’s chapter, there is no use of race as lens through which to understand varying experiences of universities during war time. It seems unlikely that the experience of veterans returning to university study after the end of a war would be unaffected by race, given that Aboriginal persons did not universally gain suffrage in Canada until 1960. It may be possible to justify the exclusion of discussions about class and race from this edition but Stortz and Panayotidis do not do so, nor do they justify the primacy they accord to gender in examining experiences of war.

On the whole, Cultures, Communities, and Conflict: Histories of Canadian Universities and War is likely to be of more interest to historians than sociologists. Most of the chapters are firmly anchored in particular contexts and bounded by time and geography. The recognition of these contexts is a strength, but on the whole, neither the individual contributors or the editors examine how these themes can be relevant beyond that context. There are few discussions of broader concepts from Gidney, who states that she intends to challenge the concept of generation as a meaningful lens through which to understand responses to war, but a significant portion of her chapter details the specifics of teach-ins at the University of Toronto. This lack of broader extensions and discussions of concepts means that this edited volume would be most useful to readers with an interest in a particular theme, such as the history of a particular conflict, women’s participation in university education, the development of research as an emphasis in Canadian universities, or the development of particular institutions discussed in these case studies. There is little space devoted to explaining why these case studies should be of interest to readers more generally.
Anastasia Kulpa is a Doctoral Candidate at the University of Alberta in Educational Policy Studies. Her focus is on the sociology of higher education, specifically the social contexts of teaching and learning within the university context. Her dissertation examines the effects of assigning failing grades on the professional identities of university faculty. Her other research explores gamification in postsecondary classrooms and the implementation of gender-inclusive policies at Canadian universities.